

California Broadband Council

May 19, 2021
Meeting Minutes

The California Broadband Council (CBC) met on Wednesday May 19, 2021 at 10:01am via virtual conference (per [California Executive Order N-25-20](#)).

Agenda Item 1 – Welcome

Council Chair Amy Tong welcomed Council members and attendees.

Roll Call

A quorum was established for the meeting.

Member	Designee	Present	Absent
California Department of Technology Director	Amy Tong	X	
California Public Utilities Commission President	Marybel Batjer	Martha Guzman-Aceves	X
California Office of Emergency Services Director	Mark Ghilarducci	Patrick Mallon	X
Superintendent of Public Instruction	Tony Thurmond	Geoff Belleau	X
Department of General Services Director	Ana Lasso	Brent Jamison	X
California State Transportation Agency Secretary	David Kim	Lori Pepper	X
California Emerging Technology Fund President	Sunne Wright McPeak	X	
California Department of Food and Agriculture	Karen Ross	X	
State Librarian	Greg Lucas	Laura Sasaki	X
Governor's Office of the Tribal Advisor	Christina Snider	X	
Member of the Senate	Ben Hueso	Sarah Smith	X

Member of the Assembly	Mike Gipson	Dr. Angelo Williams	X*	
------------------------	-------------	---------------------	----	--

*Dr. Williams arrived mid-meeting.

Ms. Tong introduced Scott Adam's, the California Department of Technology's new Deputy Director for Broadband and Digital Literacy, and welcomed new Department of General Services Director Ana Lasso and new State Librarian Designee Laura Sasaki. Ms. Tong noted former State Librarian Designee Anne Neville-Bonilla and California State University Chief Information Officer Michael Berman would be advisors to the Council.

Mr. Adams provided an overview of his broadband action plan, noted upcoming opportunities, and thanked Council staff.

Ms. Tong noted that since there had been a great deal of broadband policy activity, both at the federal and state level, since the February Council meeting, including a Governor's May Revise Proposal earmark of \$7 billion for broadband infrastructure and access. She thanked Ms. Neville-Bonilla, Robert Tse, Robert Osborn, and Michael Minkus for their support on recommendations for federal broadband efforts.

Mr. Adams noted that 2020 focused on the [executive order](#) and development of the [Action Plan](#) and 2021 is focusing on ensuring the both are moving forward. He noted that this meeting will focus on progress of the executive order and the remaining 2021 meetings would focus on action plan progress.

Ms. Ross welcomed Mr. Adams and thanked him for his assistance on helping coordinate a letter to the United States Department of Agriculture about Reconnect. She also thanked Ms. McPeak for her broadband access at fairgrounds advocacy.

Ms. McPeak provided additional detail about the project Ms. Ross mentioned.

Mr. Medigovich informed the Council that this would be his last meeting as designee for Director Ghillarducci because he was stepping down from state service. Mr. Mallon would be Mr. Ghillarducci's designee.

Agenda Item 2 – Executive Order non Action Plan Updates

Lead entities of Governor Newsom's August 2020 [Executive Order N-73-20](#) presented updates of the order's items.

Ms. Guzman-Aceves welcomed Commissioner Darcie Houck, who is now leading the California Advanced Services Fund and will be the designee for President Batjer.

California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) – Rob Osborn provided updates on Executive Order Item #3 (Mapping and Data) and #8 (Deployment).

Executive Order Item #3: The California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) is requested to lead data aggregation and mapping efforts in collaboration with the California State

Transportation Agency (CalSTA) and other relevant state agencies, local and tribal governments, and regional consortia. These efforts should address:

- a. Locations without broadband access;
- b. Information on public and private broadband network infrastructure;
- c. State-owned infrastructure and rights of way;
- d. The costs of deploying various middle and last-mile network components; and
- e. Information to support the development of local broadband infrastructure deployment and digital equity plans.

To date, the CPUC has completed:

- Participating in the federal [Digital Opportunity Collection](#) docket.
- Completed and posted [annual broadband data collection](#)
- Posted Rural Opportunity Fund Awards areas on the afore-linked maps
- Completed CalSPEED tests from last year (fall 2020) and posted those results on the afore-linked maps

In progress (ongoing) is:

- Further engagement in the federal docket.
- Further mobile broadband testing.
- CalSPEED testing to inform resiliency requirements, including backup power.
- Assisting the California Department of Technology with the Broadband For All portal.

Executive Order Item #8: CPUC, in collaboration with CDT and other relevant agencies, is requested to seek opportunities to use programs under its jurisdiction to accelerate broadband deployment and to leverage utility infrastructure to increase access to existing fiber and cost-effectively deploy new fiber.

- CPUC has an open proceeding.
- There is an order instituting broadband infrastructure deployment and to support service providers in the state.
- This item is also an ongoing item, involves a CPUC deployment proceeding and an order instituting rulemaking regarding broadband infrastructure deployment.
- Investor-owned utilities will submit pilot proposals by 07-15-21.

Ms. Smith asked if the CPUC obtains its data from the Federal Communications Commission's (FCC) Form 477. Mr. Osborn replied that the CPUC solicits the data directly from the providers and it is typically in the Form 477 format and once they receive the data they go through a validation process to try to determine if service is actually available. Ms. Smith asked if there were gaps in the Form 477 data that are important for determining adequate broadband access. Mr. Osborn responded that issue is the main focus of the FCC's Digital Opportunity Data Collection proceedings where they are trying to get more granular, accurate data.

Mr. Osborn noted that the Governor's [proposed May Revise Budget](#) includes \$7 billion as part of a package of broadband proposals as part of investments to support equitable-based broadband and provided high-level detail about the funding.

Ms. Snider pointed out tribal eligibility is included.

Ms. Smith asked, and Mr. Osborn provided, clarification of funding in relation to CASF.

Ms. Guzman-Aceves pointed out the importance of the continuation of, and reforms to, CASF.

Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development (GO-Biz) – Kaina Pereira provided updates on Executive Order Item #5 (Funding) and #13 (Adoption).

Executive Order Item #5: GO-Biz is directed to identify funding opportunities for broadband deployment and adoption by:

- a. Collaborating with all cabinet-level agencies, independent departments, and independent constitutional officers to create a list of funding sources to support broadband, equipment, and digital literacy; and
- b. Coordinating efforts of state agencies to maximize federal broadband funding for California.

To date, GO-Biz has convened a number of times to identify state resources that can be used for federal matches, as well as the types of resources available to administer such programs.

GO-Biz is also meeting every two weeks with all of the Federal District 9 representatives. Even with projects not specifically earmarked for broadband, broadband can be considered. Shovel-ready projects with broadband will get prioritized through all agencies. There are still administrative rules, policies, and procedures to be ironed out and expect that information to come soon.

GO-Biz will continue to work with CDT and other parties. They are also working on engaging philanthropy throughout the state focusing more on regional elements to help with planning, etc.

Executive Order Item #13: GO-Biz is directed to coordinate the outreach efforts of existing statewide programs and institutions to inform residents of affordable internet service offerings including:

- a. The CPUC is requested to develop tools for low-income individuals and social service organizations to easily identify and subscribe to affordable broadband plans;
- b. The California Emerging Technologies Fund is directed to continue promoting affordable home internet service offers to recipients of the National School Lunch Program; and
- c. The California State Library is, in consultation with local libraries, is directed to promote affordable home internet services within their communities.

GO-Biz has had intake conversations with many of the involved entities and with new programs coming, will continue to keep all the parties updated.

The California Emerging Technology Fund (CETF) is named in EO #13b. Ms. McPeak noted that CETF's efforts include getting technology into homes, focusing on disadvantaged families, people with disabilities, non-English as-a-first language, and non-English speaking people. CETF has partnered with the California Department of Education (CDE), which has a landing page and direct link to the work CETF does. CETF also has been reaching out to county offices of education and county superintendents. They have engaged former Superintendent of

Public Instruction Tom Torlakson to perform outreach and reached out to numerous school districts with the most disadvantaged pupils and many of those districts will get information to those students about affordable offers.

The federal government authorized the Emergency Broadband Program (EBB) and CETF has switched to focusing on promoting and assisting with EBB efforts to help California get its fair share. Internet service providers need to help on outreach with FCC reporting, etc.

Information about the statewide survey on broadband adoption is in the chat notes. Ms. McPeak thanked all CETF's partners.

Mr. Jamison and Ms. Smith asked, and Ms. McPeak and Ms. Guzman-Aceves responded to questions, about EBB specifics and affordable plans. Ms. Tong spoke about the importance of affordable plans being long-term (as opposed to temporary).

Ms. Sasaki provided an update on EO #13c, updating the Council on the training the State Library provided to librarians throughout the state, will be providing Emergency Broadband Funding training, and continue to provide them with resources.

California Department of Technology (CDTPUC) – Scott Adams provided updates on Executive Order Item #4 (Mapping and Data) and #6 (Funding).

Executive Order Item #4: The California Department of Technology (CDT), in collaboration with the Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development (GO-Biz) and the Department of General Services (DGS), is directed to regularly convene private-sector companies in an effort to understand and predict current and future demand for broadband, for the purpose of enabling the State to more effectively allocate resources and manage policies and programs supporting broadband goals and continuing the State's leadership in broadband innovation.

Mr. Adams noted:

- Prior to his arrival there were two convening sessions with companies to solicit input as part of the development of the Action Plan.
- It will be an ongoing effort.
- CDT is working with GO-Biz.

Executive Order Item #6: CDT, in collaboration with DGS, is directed to seek opportunities to leverage the State's contract authorities as resources to further statewide broadband access and adoption.

Mr. Adams noted:

- The February Parks and Recreation / CDT presentation provided an overview of actions to date.
- Moving forward, CDT will be collaborating with DGS.

California Transportation Agency - Ms. Pepper thanked partner agencies, departments, etc., for their collaboration and introduced Elizabeth Dooher to provide an update on EO Item #7 (Deployment).

Executive Order Item #7: CalSTA and California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) are directed to work with the California Transportation Commission (CTC) to identify and incorporate the installation of conduit and/or fiber into all appropriate and feasible transportation projects along strategic corridors.

Ms. Dooher noted work to date:

- Established broadband coordinator position
- Facilitating standalone and partnership projects
- Hosting outreach meetings to incorporate stakeholder input
- Incorporating broadband in planning phase of transportation projects to ensure broadband needs are part of transportation planning
- Identifying projects in design and construction phases to identify where it is feasible to add conduit and broadband

She also provided an example of how the work will be used.

Ms. McPeak noted that CPUC and CalSTA and Caltrans have done an amazing job at clearing permit backlogs.

Department of General Services – Mr. Jamison provided an update on EO Order #9 (Deployment).

Executive Order Item #9: DGS is directed to provide an inventory of state property for possible use for broadband infrastructure based on such criteria as may be provided by the CPUC, Caltrans, and other relevant agencies, to accelerate broadband deployment.

Mr. Jamison noted that the effort requires criteria to identify properties. There are more than 43,000 properties in the statewide index, so this item will not be an easy or quick endeavor. DGS has met with Caltrans and CPUC as part of ongoing work to develop criteria. He noted there is a statutory 10-year limitation to the state's leasing authority that isn't conducive to investment in properties. The department is seeking statutory changes to expand DGS's authority when it leases properties and hopefully it will encourage greater investment and interest. Industry meetings will be important as DGS, CPUC, and Caltrans develop criteria and try to identify properties adequate for broadband deployment.

Governor's Office of Emergency Services – Mr. Mallon provided an update on EO Order #10 (Deployment).

Executive Order Item #10: The Governor's Office of Emergency Services (CalOES) is directed to coordinate with jurisdictions implementing Next-Generation 9-1-1 to expand broadband infrastructure to enhance public safety and disaster preparedness, response, recovery, and mitigation capabilities.

Mr. Mallon noted CalOES is about 75% done with the installation of the equipment in the 438 PSAPs, public safety answering points. There is a mix of broadband service providers. Mr. Mallon expanded on Next Gen 911 efforts and the relation to local communities.

California Department of Food and Agriculture – Ms. Ross provided an update on EO Order #11 (Deployment).

Executive Order Item #11: The California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) is directed to identify and facilitate new broadband projects that support precision agriculture and food systems in rural communities. CDFA is also directed to work with CalOES to inventory the status of existing broadband connectivity at all fairgrounds.

Ms. Ross noted that there was not an update for precision agriculture because the department has been without a deputy secretary for some time and they are hopeful they will have a deputy secretary soon to continue the work. CDFA is working with CalOES on EO Item #10.

California Department of Housing and Community Development – Josh Rosa provided an update on EO Order #12 (Deployment).

Executive Order Item #12: The California Department of Housing and Community Development and the California Housing Finance Agency are directed to provide recommendations to the CPUC to increase free or low-cost broadband connectivity at all publicly subsidized housing communities for residential units.

Mr. Rosa noted that the five roadblocks to connectivity are availability, affordability, accessibility to devices, digital skills, and data.

To date, [initial] interagency consultations, stakeholder engagement, and asset management and preservation practices review have commenced.

In progress are multifamily housing program pilot criteria and broadband needs assessment surveys.

Upcoming work includes coordination with TCAC and California Housing Finance Agency, the conduction of surveys, and recommendations to the CPUC.

Dr. Williams thanked Mr. Rosa for his presentation and noted the importance of broadband access in affordable housing. Ms. McPeak emphasized the work Mr. Rosa presented is to support the most disadvantaged and most digitally-disconnected Californians.

Ms. Guzman-Aceves noted universal service and the obligation to serve all Californians is important and we shouldn't lose focus, we need to think holistically.

California Department of Education – Geoff Belleau provided an update on EO Order #14 (Adoption).

Executive Order Item #14: The California Department of Education is requested to continue leading statewide efforts to ensure that students have the computing devices and connectivity necessary for distance learning and online instruction.

Mr. Belleau noted items that have been completed include:

- Assisting the Governor and First Partner in distributing computing devices and hot spots
- Assisting in the distribution of broadband subsidies
- Regularly meeting with county offices of education chief technology officers to coordinate device and connectivity issues
- Advocacy and education about federal connectivity options
- Superintendent's Digital Divide Task force pushed providers to continue to offer low-cost programs
- Worked with manufacturers to bring more than a million computing devices to students
- Updated department web site and emailed school districts weekly with product availability for computers and hotspots
- Supported Speaker Rendon's Broadband Workgroup

And items in progress include:

- Digital Divide Innovation Challenge
- Mapping students and schools do get more accurate digital divide data
- Evaluating the best solutions for differing parts of the state and the potential for a tool kit
- More work with county offices regarding CDT, E-rate, technology planning, and digital learning
- Continued outreach and trainings for schools
- Continued collaboration with other council member agencies to focus on solutions and accountability

Mr. Belleau thanked others for all their work.

California Department of Aging – Mark Beckley provided an update on EO Order #15 (Adoption).

Executive Order Item #15: The California Department of Aging, in partnership with CDT and CPUC, is directed to analyze the needs of people ages 60 and older for access to affordable, reliable, high-speed broadband, and to identify program and partnership opportunities to close the digital divide among older Californians.

Mr. Beckley presented a dashboard which overlays CPUC statewide access data with data of where older adults reside, reviewed needs of the state's aging populations, and noted budget funding for broadband and digital literacy for older adults. The department will be added dedicated staff for broadband and digital literacy for older adults efforts.

Ms. Guzman-Aceves facilitated questions from the chat.

Agenda Item 3 – Public Comment

Public comment was made by:

- Larry Ortega.

Mr. Adams noted next steps would be identifying dates for upcoming council meeting and hearing about Action Plan items.

The meeting adjourned at 1:55pm.

Attachment: Zoom meeting comments.

Zoom Comments

13:16:47 From adelina.zendejas to Everyone:

Mitch - Congratulations!!! It has been a pleasure working with you! Best of luck in your future ventures.

13:17:05 From Karen Ross to Everyone:

Mitch - we will miss you! Thank you.

13:17:20 From Martha Guzman Aceves to Everyone:

Good luck Mitch!!

13:19:35 From Darcie Houck to Everyone:

Thank you Martha. I am happy to be here and looking forward to working with everyone.

13:19:53 From Laura Sasaki - California State Library to Everyone:

Welcome, Darcie!

13:20:10 From Amy Tong to Everyone:

Welcome Commissioner Houck

13:20:11 From Jules to Everyone:

We will post all the slides to the Council web site.

13:21:47 From Amy Tong to Everyone:

Thank you Martha for all your work and contribution to CBC, we will miss you.

13:25:37 From Karen Ross to Everyone:

Martha - thank you for all your great work on broadband. We will miss you on CBC.

13:26:53 From larry ortega to Everyone:

What accounting or audits have been performed by the CPUC regarding promises made by providers during mega-mergers to connect low income households? Example: Comcast/NBC-Universal merger made a commitment to connect millions of families.

13:34:11 From larry ortega to Everyone:

What role will the CPUC be playing to ensure fair and reasonable pricing on high speed broadband. Proposed subsidies by the FCC \$50 presumes pricing is fair, yet the

providers in CA are charging three times what our counter-parts in Europe, Israel and Asia are paying?

13:34:20 From larry ortega to Everyone:

thank you Comm. Guzman.

13:41:04 From Cal BIS to Everyone:

Thank you for the opportunity to present. Apologies for having to leave for another engagement. Appreciate all the hard work!!! have a great day!

13:42:20 From Jules to Everyone:

CETF links:

IMPLEMENTATION OF BROADBAND FOR ALL EXECUTIVE ORDER AND ACTION PLAN CETF MAY 19, 2021 CALIFORNIA BROADBAND COUNCIL PROGRESS REPORT

<https://www.cetfund.org/report/implementation-of-broadband-for-all-executive-order-and-action-plan-progress-report/>

CETF USC STATEWIDE SURVEY ON BROADBAND ADOPTION 2021 MARCH 30, 2021

Results Presentation

https://www.cetfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Annual_Survey_2021_CETF_USC_Final_Summary_Report_CETF_A.pdf

Report

<https://www.cetfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Statewide-Survey-on-Broadband-Adoption-CETF-Report.pdf>

CETF Press Release

https://www.cetfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Statewide-Survey-on-Broadband-Adoption_CETF_Press_Release_210330.pdf

BROADBAND IS A VITAL GREEN STRATEGY APRIL 19, 2021

Report

<https://www.cetfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/Statewide-Survey-on-Broadband-Adoption-Sustainability-and-Green-Strategies.pdf>

CETF Press Release

<https://www.cetfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/Statewide-Survey-2021-Vital-Green-Strategy-CETF->

13:46:51 From larry ortega to Everyone:

This statistic of 91% connected directly contradicts with what we know that 40% of our kids could not connect to high-speed broadband during the pandemic? Can you reconcile?

13:48:19 From Jules to Everyone:

Emergency Broadband Benefit <https://www.fcc.gov/broadbandbenefit>

13:48:51 From Robert Osborn to Everyone:

Find out more about the EBB here: <https://covid19.ca.gov/emergency-broadband/>

13:52:37 From larry ortega to Everyone:

Ms. McPeak will you advocate for fair pricing be addressed in CA? Pricing is a major barrier for those in the digital divide, it seems like your efforts and attention to this matter could make a significant difference in prioritizing this issue.

13:57:40 From Mary Nicely to Everyone:

Thank you Commissioner Guzman. We must hold these ISPs accountable. We're all in to support.

14:00:30 From larry ortega to Everyone:

The regulatory authority is there within the CPUC to mandate fair and reasonable pricing. Why is there opposition to use the tools already in place?

14:03:34 From Jules to Everyone:

Executive Order <https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/8.14.20-EO-N-73-20.pdf>

14:05:05 From Sarah Smith to Everyone:

Apologies - I need to sign off to run to another meeting. Thank you to the CBC and attendees.

14:06:02 From adelina.zendejas to Everyone:

Commissioner Guzman-Aceves - Thank you for your ongoing support to the CBC and Broadband and Digital Literacy Office. As mentioned by Amy, your CPUC broadband team have been amazing.

14:29:51 From Sunne Wright McPeak to Everyone:

We applaud Assemblymember Gipson for his courage in trying to get all residents in Publicly-Subsidized Housing Complexes finally fully connected and digitally literate. These residents are the poorest Californians and the most digitally-disadvantaged. We need to get AB1425 passed.

14:34:52 From Geoff Belleau to Everyone:

Sunne...the CDE does support all 80K migrant students across CA...

14:36:32 From larry ortega to Everyone:

Bravo Comm. Guzman! Good point.

14:36:40 From Sunne Wright McPeak to Everyone:

Can we reach out to all those students and their families about EBB and get them registered with FCC-USAC?

14:45:16 From Laura Sasaki - California State Library to Everyone:

Collaboration welcome on EBB - we want relevant information out there about the FCC programs

14:46:27 From David Espinoza to Everyone:

I have a quick question, can CDE share the student locations with regional consortia?

14:49:39 From larry ortega to Everyone:

When you speak of devices do you mean that to say wireless devices only?

14:50:05 From larry ortega to Everyone:

Question for CDA: When you speak of devices do you mean that to say wireless devices only?

14:51:18 From Geoff Belleau to Everyone:

@david...email digitaldivide@cde.ca.gov and we can determine what is allowed to be shared in alignment with privacy laws

14:51:58 From Laura Sasaki - California State Library to Everyone:

CDA: how long do you expect to be able to provide access?

14:52:41 From noshir to CDT STAFF(Direct Message):

Will we be getting a copy of all the presentations as follows up? Thx.

14:53:12 From David Espinoza to Everyone:

@ Geoff. Thank you for your response. I will follow up by email.